WHAT DO WE KNOW ABOUT CUSTOMER SATISFACTION IN THE HOSPITALITY AND TOURISM INDUSTRY? THE GLIMPSE FROM A BIBLIOMETRIC ANALYSIS

Nuril Aulia Munawaroh, Imam Mukhlis, Arief Noviarakhman Zagladi
1 Doctoral Program of Management Science, Universitas Negeri Malang
2 Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Negeri Malang
E-mail: nuril.aulia.2304139@students.um.ac.id, imam.mukhlis.fe@um.ac.id, arief.zagladi.fe@um.ac.id

Abstract
Numerous previous studies have emphasized that investigating customer behavior in hospitality and tourism services is a crucial research area that significantly impacts the industry's success, particularly in terms of customer satisfaction. According to a report by Small Business Chron, customer satisfaction holds paramount importance in the hospitality and tourism industry, where customers pay close attention to the quality of service they receive. The goal of this paper is to offer researchers a systematic view of how this topic contributes to the development of effective research channels for future analysis and research on the subject. The method used is bibliometric analysis, and mapping analysis has been conducted involving 107 articles from the SCOPUS database on customer satisfaction spanning from the year 2013 to 2023. The study employs bibliometric analysis of literature using Vosviewer. The findings reveal that research on customer satisfaction has steadily grown over the study period in the hospitality and tourism industry. The network analysis of customer satisfaction publications indicates that important themes covered include service quality, customer experience, customer value, and customer reviews.

Keywords: Bibliometric, Customer Satisfaction, Hospitality, Tourism

1. INTRODUCTION
The hospitality and tourism industry has grown steadily over the years and has become a major profit generator in the global economy's service sector (Liat et al., 2017). The hospitality and tourism industry are widely recognized as one of the most fiercely competitive markets worldwide. Therefore, numerous countries are striving to attract visitors and tourists to their destinations, thereby enabling them to develop and improve the quality of life in their nations (Oh & Kim, 2017). Numerous previous studies have emphasized that investigating customer behavior in hospitality and tourism services is a crucial research area that significantly impacts the industry's success, such as customer satisfaction. The customer plays a crucial role in both the firm and the market. To thrive, organizations must provide products and services of great quality that result in very satisfied and devoted customers (Fečíková, 2004).

For many years, customer satisfaction has been recognized as a major predictor of loyalty. Customer satisfaction is a strategic approach in a company that emphasizes the significance of generating value for customers, predicting and handling their expectations, and showcasing the capability and accountability to fulfill their requirements (Dominici & Guzzo, 2010). Obtaining and maintaining client happiness is one of the most difficult contemporary difficulties for managers in service sectors (Su &
Customer satisfaction is one of the most widely debated topics in advertising literature from a decade ago (Khudhair et al., 2019). The remarkable fervor for ensuring customer satisfaction can be attributed to its importance in achieving sustainable competitive advantages and financial outcomes (Aya Sofia, 2023; Kassim & Asiah Abdullah, 2010).

The concept of "satisfaction" has been studied in a variety of hospitality and tourism contexts since the satisfaction economy's inception (P.J. et al., 2023), including airlines (Chow, 2014; Hussain, 2016; Tahanisaz & shokuhyar, 2020) hotels (Bi et al., 2020; Li et al., 2020; Radojevic et al., 2017) cruises (Castillo-Manzano & López-Valpuesta, 2018; Tao & Kim, 2019), restaurants (Irfan Sabir et al., 2014; Nguyen et al., 2018) (Tran et al., 2021; Vajčnerová et al., 2014). According to a report by Small Business Chron, customer satisfaction is crucial in the hospitality and tourism industry, where customers are paying attention to the type of service, they receive (Belcher, 2019).

Hospitality and tourism experts have explored various aspects of customer satisfaction, including its popularity, importance, and the challenges involved in its creation and upkeep, numerous terms reflect the perspective from which satisfaction is examined tourists (Hussain, 2016; Kaura et al., 2015), guest (Padma & Ahn, 2020), student (Vo et al., 2022), consumer (Meesala & Paul, 2018) and visitors (Sæþórsdóttir & Hall, 2020). In this paper, we refer to all forms of satisfaction from a consumer perspective as "customer satisfaction" as we believe that every social and service exchange contributes to it, regardless of its shape and nature. Undoubtedly, hospitality and tourism have emerged as prominent subjects of study in the field of managing business operations due to their significant global economic impact. The academy has also shown a keen interest, particularly in the exploration of the fundamental components of customer satisfaction in the hotel industry (Radojevic et al., 2017). Despite the significant economic impact of tourism in any country, there are still numerous areas that require further investigation.

To the best of the authors' knowledge, however, studies on the evolution and structure of customer satisfaction are surprisingly scarce. Academics have presented a comprehensive analysis of customer satisfaction, which is a significant sub-category within the broader field of customer satisfaction (Ha & Park, 2013; Ladeira et al., 2016; Oh & Kim, 2017), to provide an extensive analysis of the wider literature on customer satisfaction and suggest a methodology for effectively managing customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism industry. However, there is still a requirement for a more unified integration of relevant research in the fields of hospitality and tourism. This study provides a comprehensive overview of the existing research on customer satisfaction in the field of hospitality and tourism. It aims to carefully analyze the development and evolution of literature in this area, offering a scientific evaluation of the growth of this sector.

Hospitality and tourism researchers have examined and analyzed the conceptual and intellectual structure of certain subjects such as customer engagement (So et al., 2021) multisensory experience design (Agapito, 2020) and social media (Leung et al., 2017). Recently, bibliometric studies have been carried out in the field of hospitality and tourism
to analyze and map the changes and trends in the discipline, providing scholars with a better understanding of its evolution (Agapito, 2020; So et al., 2021). A bibliometric study provides a thorough and rigorous assessment of the literature published in a particular research field by visually representing the growth of knowledge and the organization of the literature over time (Linnenluecke et al., 2020). A bibliometric analysis is particularly valuable for objectively evaluating scientific literature and can be a helpful tool in conducting literature reviews without significant subjective bias (Zupic & Čater, 2015).

Given the significance of both customer satisfaction and bibliometric studies in providing a foundation on which researchers can build to develop the discipline, it is vital to pay attention to how customer satisfaction research has evolved.

A comprehensive bibliographic search conducted over the past three decades has yielded a total of 445 scholarly papers, articles, and theses that have specifically examined the concept of satisfaction within the tourism and hospitality industry (Ladeira et al., 2016). The authors found a total of 292 distinct forms of satisfaction, together with their potential causes and effects. The evaluation of these itineraries was conducted based on the perspectives of a substantial number of travelers from 56 different nations. Nevertheless, despite the extensive body of research examining the theoretical correlation between satisfaction and its precursors and outcomes, the findings lack coherence and exhibit inconsistency in numerous instances. One example is the impact of loyalty, as evidenced by articles that indicate a positive correlation (Song et al., 2011) and negative (Campo & Yagüe, 2008).

Different interpretations of the prediction and explanation of these relationships result from these inconsistencies. As a result, it's essential to systematize the empirical findings of these publications that deal with employee happiness in the travel and hospitality industry. Based on this logic, the authors evaluated the primary causes and effects of the linked dimensions of satisfaction in tourism and hospitality by conducting a meta-analysis of the empirical research. This study aims to address the existing research gap by performing a comprehensive literature review to cater to the requirements of studies on customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism industry. Even though customer satisfaction has been the subject of research in many other fields, this study adds something unique to the field's understanding of customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism industry. In order to have a thorough understanding of the current body of literature on customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism industry, we carry out a bibliometric analysis. Bibliometric analysis is acknowledged as a valuable tool for comprehending the patterns and changes in published publications, as well as identifying key subjects in different academic fields. The bibliometric study can map research trends regarding themes, methodologies, country settings, data levels and publication quality (Indarti et al., 2020). Therefore, this study aims to answer the following research questions:

**RQ1:** What is the profile of previous research that highlights customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism industry (i.e. publication trends, publishers, quality of journals, methodologies, and regional classifications)?

**RQ2:** What are the implications of this study’s potential future study suggestions?
2. RESEARCH METHOD

The objective of this study was to do a systematic literature review (SLR) on the topic of customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism industry. The study provided a comprehensive analysis that involved both quantitative methods, specifically a systematic review using a database of possible or selected articles in the relevant subject, and qualitative methods, specifically content analysis (Miles & Hubberman, 1994). The article review profile was mapped using the quantitative method, employing descriptive statistics. Concurrently, the qualitative study employs an extensive examination of the literature to investigate customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism sectors. The efficacy of this systematic review method has been acknowledged across several disciplines for its ability to enhance the rigor of research (Talwar et al., 2020), offer impartial, unbiased, and transparent outcomes with little bias (Seth et al., 2020), and ensure objectivity throughout the process to expand opportunities and replicate synthesis results (Seth et al., 2020; Talwar et al., 2020). To enhance the transparency and replicability of our research, we utilized several literature-based recommendations about the process of performing systematic literature reviews (SLRs) (Chouki et al., 2020; Indarti et al., 2020; Talwar et al., 2020).

2.1. Inclusion And Exclusion Criteria

Before creating the data set for this study, the second phase was establishing the inclusion and exclusion criteria. This was done to ensure the accurate classification of the studies and maintain the validity of our systematic review. The criteria for inclusion and exclusion were determined according to the research inquiries and implemented based on our discernment. The study's inclusion criteria encompass the following: only research published in English and published for the years of 2013 - 2023, across diverse disciplines are considered to expand the scope of the search, articles published in peer-reviewed journals and academic journal articles; and, articles that emphasize and have direct focuses on customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism industry. The exclusion criteria used for this study are removing duplicate articles across databases, disregarding articles that lack of focus on customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism sector, and excluding articles that are unrelated to customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism industry.

Research has shown that conducting a systematic review analysis that specifically examines peer-reviewed journal papers is very influential and more reliable compared to other sources (Podsakoff et al., 2005). Highlight the significance of doing a thorough examination of the entrepreneurship literature to guarantee research that is both transparent and reliable (Ladeira et al., 2016). The authors assessed the relevance of each article to customer satisfaction and the hospitality and tourism industry. Articles unrelated to the issue of customer satisfaction and the hospitality and tourism industry were eliminated. We conducted a comprehensive search across Scopus journal databases to gather a substantial volume of article data. Scopus are often used in SLR because of its comprehensive list of journal databases, especially in social science research (Mongeon & Paul-Hus, 2016).
2.2. Data Retrieval and Selection

Figure 1. Offers a concise summary of the study's phases throughout the process of data selection and collection. We used a sample of criteria derived from keyword searches (Patton, 1990) to identify valuable articles relating to customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism industry. Considering the diversity of academic disciplines, it is reasonable that we employed multiple combinations of search phrases, as researchers from different subjects often employ distinct terminology to depict comparable occurrences. We use the asterisk (*), “OR” and “AND” connectors to develop search strings in the database. As the study focuses on customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism industry; consequently, we initially concentrate on two keywords: “customer satisfaction” and “hospitality and tourism” industry.

We search for similarities between each keyword and combine them to broaden the search for relevant articles. We define relevant keywords for “customer satisfaction” include “guest satisfaction” and “client satisfaction”; “hospitality” and “tourism” include “hotel”, “airlines”, “cruise”, “and restaurant”. Employing the Scopus database enables us to acquire a plethora of pertinent articles about the subject of investigation. The syntax employed for searching titles, abstracts, and keywords is consistent throughout the Scopus database, encompassing many disciplines. We retrieved 1,115 articles from the Scopus database.

**Figure 1. Systematic search and selection strategies on Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry**
2.3. Data Analysis
The 107 publications mentioned earlier were analyzed using bibliometric analysis and content analysis. Initially, we determined the significant elements of the literature, including journals, time frame, distribution of countries of origin, theoretical frameworks, metrics of consumer involvement, and conceptualizations. Subsequently, we compiled a comprehensive review of the existing literature on consumer involvement within the tourist and hospitality industry. Ultimately, we discussed areas that require further investigation in future study and the practical implications for managers, drawing on the analytical findings.

Data analysis is performed subsequent to acquiring potential articles that are pertinent to the subject matter of the study. A total of 107 articles will undergo further analysis in order to obtain a deeper understanding of consumer satisfaction within the hospitality and tourism sector. At this step, there are two distinct processes. Initially, the study is profiled by examining the year of publication, article source, journal publisher, journal ranking, country setting, and research design.

3. RESULTN AND DISCUSSION
3.1. Research Results
We have organized our study findings based on the journals they were published in, the time period they cover, the countries they originate from, the conceptualizations and measurement of customer satisfaction used, and the theoretical underpinning they are based on.

3.1.1. Distribution of Articles by Journal and Year
A total of 107 papers on Customer Satisfaction (CF) were published across 72 distinct journals, catering to both general and specialized readerships. The distribution across journals is demonstrated (see Figure 2). A total of 76 papers were published in journals specializing in the field of hospitality and tourism. The remaining articles were published in service marketing, marketing, and other business publications. Hospitality and Tourism Management has authored the highest number of articles on customer satisfaction in the field of hospitality and tourism.

![Figure 2. Distribution of Paper by Journal](image-url)
Research on customer satisfaction encompasses a broad range of methodologies (see Table 1). Table 1 illustrates that qualitative and quantitative research are equally prevalent methodologies. Various methods of analysis and data collecting, including in-depth interviews (such as focus groups), documentary analysis, content analysis, surveys, scenario-based experimental design, field experiments, and big data, have been extensively utilized. We classify research techniques into two main groups: research strategy (quantitative, qualitative, and mixed-methods). Based on the examined result, quantitative was the most used research strategy [86% of articles (n=92)] compared to qualitative and mixed methods. Among the 92 quantitative studies, the researchers used two fundamental methods: survey and panel data. Panel data was mostly utilized as the principal study methodology (n=3) employing secondary data for analysis obtained from many sources, such as online customer review and enterprise surveys.

Qualitative researchers acknowledge qualitative research as a distinct methodology. The utilization of this method does not impose a constraint on the investigation, but it does emphasize the necessity for enhanced clarity regarding the employed methodology. The case study was the most prevalent methodology employed in qualitative research (n=10) using the interview method. Another strategy that focuses on quality rather than quantity is a descriptive study (n=4). Finally, only one search employed a mixed technique utilizing a sequential exploratory design.

Table 1. Research Methodology on Reviewed Papers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Methodology Type</th>
<th>Number of Papers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2013-2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualitative Methodology</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantitative Methodology</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Methodology</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The sequence of articles on Customer Satisfaction in hospitality and tourism is displayed in chronological order in Figure 3. The results show that service quality and customer satisfaction are becoming increasingly popular and significant areas of research in the fields of tourism and hospitality.

Figure 3. Document Published on Customer Satisfaction in Hospitality and Tourism per year
Publications have experienced a consistent increase from 2016 to 2020, barring the exception of years 2021 and 2023. The year 2021 witnessed the global spread of the COVID-19 pandemic, which caused a significant change in the focus of research in the academic community.

One possible explanation for the decline in the number of publications published in 2021 may be that researchers prioritized studying the effects of COVID-19 on the tourism and hospitality industry. The majority of the journals focused on topics related to the pandemic and the handling of health crises. One potential cause for the decline in the number of publications in 2021 could be attributed to this factor. Saturation of research might happen in 2023, in some cases, a field of study may reach a point of saturation, where many fundamental questions have been answered. This can lead to a decrease in research activity as researchers seek new and more niche areas to explore.

The geographical distribution of the literature demonstrates the extent of the study conducted worldwide (Fatma & Rahman, 2015; Goyal et al., 2013). In order to determine the country of origin for each publication, the researchers noted the geographical location of the study participants. In research with insufficient participants, such as conceptual investigations. Out of the 107 publications that were identified in the field of Customer Satisfaction in hospitality and tourism, the majority were found to have originated from Malaysia (15), China (12), India (11) and Indonesia (10). The remaining papers from other countries or regions are shown in Figure 4. The ongoing enhancement and development of developing countries’ emerging markets has given rise to the expansion of global tourism corporations. Scholars have focused their attention on these underexplored locations (emerging economies) to enhance the topic of Customer Satisfaction.

3.1.2. Most Impactful Sources
The result listed in Table 2 is the ten most impactful journals that published articles on Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry. The Tourism
Management, The Journal of Travel Research and the International Journal of Hospitality Management are the most powerful impact journals on Customer Satisfaction on Hospitality and Tourism Industry based on h-index and total citations from 2013 to 2023.

Table 2. Top Sources by Impact Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sources</th>
<th>h-index</th>
<th>Citation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Management (TM)</td>
<td>236</td>
<td>38152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Travel Research</td>
<td>159</td>
<td>14718</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal Hospitality Management (IJHM)</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>21418</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management (IJCHM)</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>13022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Issues in Tourism</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>10071</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornell Hospitality Quarterly</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>3758</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Tourism Research</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>4789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Hospitality Marketing and Management (JHMM)</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>49399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>3434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Technology</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>1285</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 is the publications on Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry that had the highest number of citations from the SCOPUS dataset. The results showed that the article with the highest number of citations was entitled “What can big data and text analytics tell us about hotel guest experience and satisfaction?” Zheng Xiang, the author who has made the greatest contribution to publications on the issue, wrote the paper.

Table 3. Ten Articles Based on The Most Number of Citations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>First Author’s Name</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Name of Journal</th>
<th>N of Citation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faruk Anil Kanouk (2019)</td>
<td>The influence of perceived food quality, price fairness, perceived value, and satisfaction on customers’ revisit and word-of-mouth intentions toward organic food restaurants</td>
<td>Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services</td>
<td>499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huiying Li (2013)</td>
<td>Determinants of customer satisfaction in the hotel industry: An application of online review analysis</td>
<td>Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research</td>
<td>465</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 shows the ten publications related to the theme of Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry that were most cited during the research period.

3.1.3. Bibliometric Analysis

The VOSviewer tool was utilized to conduct bibliometric analysis in this study. When conducting bibliometric analysis using VOSviewer, the interconnections between themes can be presented by a bibliometric mapping that consists of three visualization networks. The visualization networks consist of network visualization, overlay visualization, and density visualization. The visualization network assigns different colored circles to label the keywords/authors that emerge. The color represents the cluster associated with the keyword/author. The size of the circle is strongly correlated with the frequency of keywords/authors. Conversely, the size of the letters and circles is decided according to the frequency of their occurrence. The presence of larger letters and circles in the document being evaluated shows the occurrence of the keyword/author.

Figure 5. Distribution of Co-authors in Overlay Visualization

Based on Figure 5, 212 persons were identified as authors from the 107 papers included in this analysis. Nevertheless, there is just one cluster in the bibliometric analysis results when using the co-authorship (co-author) criteria. The co-authors cluster consisted
of 9 authors including Rabab Ali Abumalloh, O.A. Alghamdi, Muhammed Yossoof Ismael, Mohammed Ākib, Saidatulakmal Mohd., Fatima Khan Nayer, Mehrbakhshakh Nilashi, Sarminah Samad, Masoumeh Zibarbani. The co-authors’ distribution is visualized using a circular representation, with connections depicted by green lines.

These findings indicate that the co-authors of publications indexed in data SCOPUS with the theme of Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry are somewhat still low. Initially, writings about Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry were primarily authored by individuals.

In bibliometric analysis, the author’s affiliation can be determined by the institution from where they originate. The size circle of this institution indicates its significant contribution to publishing articles. The size of the circle is decided based on the number of publications, citations, and the number of linkages to other institutions. Hence, the size of the circle directly correlates with the quantity of publications, citations, and ties to other institutions. Furthermore, the hue of the circle corresponds to the year of its release. The lighter color of the circle (yellow) signifies the most recently released published. While the shade is deeper the hue of the circle corresponds to the duration for which the publication has been available. Figure 6 shows the Co-authorship institution.

![Co-Authors Institution in Overlay Visualization](image)

The number of institutions registered in this study amounted to 75 institutions. The distribution of the author’s institutions is shown by a circle in Figure 6. The blue line shows the link relationship between one institution to another. Department of Global Business, Kyungsung University is the most authoring institution that publishes articles about Customer Satisfaction in Hospitality and Tourism Industry, as many as 12 publications with 54 citations and connected to 2 other institutions.

Furthermore, the visualization of the co-authorship country mapping can be seen in the bibliometric analysis. Country clusters of collaborating authors can be seen by the size of the circle. The larger the circle of countries, the more that country publishes the number of publications and the higher the number of citations as well. Figure 6 shows the co-authorship country.
3.2. Analysis of co-occurrence keywords

In order to determine the bibliometric network between articles or online publications from the acquired SCOPUS metadata, bibliometric analysis is carried out by creating visualizations in the forms of networks, overlays, and densities. The nodes in the bibliometric network are circles or circles that stand in for keywords, while the edges, or network nodes, show the relationship between node pairs. Considering the co-occurrence requirements, Figure 7 displays the keyword distribution in network visualization. 3 different colors show the clusters of keywords based on the publication title. The first cluster is denoted by red-circled keywords. It consists of “COVID-19, guest satisfaction, hospitality, hotel, online reviews, satisfaction and service quality”. The second cluster is denoted by green-circled keywords. It consists of “consumption behavior, hospitality industry, marketing, perceived value, perception, and tourism”. The third cluster is denoted by green-circled keywords. It consists of “customer loyalty, customer satisfaction, hotel industry, and hotels”.

![Figure 7. Distribution of Keywords in Network Visualization](image)

Based on Figure 7, the keywords that showed up most frequently in articles about Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry in SCOPUS metadata set are “Customer Satisfaction” and “Service Quality”. The size of the letters and the circle in the keywords both demonstrated the keywords “Customer Satisfaction” and “Service Quality”. Additional keywords that appear frequently beside “customer satisfaction” and “service quality” such as “perception”, “perceived value”, “online reviews” and “hotel industry”. This indicates that lots of research using the above title keyword has been done in earlier studies.

Figure 8, explained how keywords are distributed in the Overlay Visualization. The colors used to categorize the circles correspond to the article’s publication period. The keyword was previously covered in publications before 2019, if the circle is darker. The intensity of the circle in the keyword indicates that it has been the subject of publications released after 2021. The initial occurrence of the keywords in the theme of Customer Satisfaction in The Hospitality and Tourism Industry is depicted as dark grey-circled. The keywords include Customer Satisfaction and Service Quality. It means, at the beginning of articles, it exhibits a high degree of correlation with Customer Satisfaction and Service Quality. This is distinct from the keywords that are present in the most recent research studies in Figure 8 shown by the yellow circle. Recent publications predominantly focus
on Customer Satisfaction in the scope of COVID-19 times, discussing satisfaction-based online reviews and the hotelier industry.

Figure 8. Distribution of Keywords in Network Visualization

Figure 9 indicates the dispersion of keyword within Density Visualization. The outcomes of the displayed visualization in Figure 9 can be determined that there are areas with a high concentration or density between each node. The high level of keyword saturation indicated by the yellow marking, suggests that the area is an extensively studied topic related to Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry indexed by the SCOPUS database. The yellow color indicates the keyword that is used most frequently including customer satisfaction, service quality, and hotel industry.

Figure 9. Distribution of Co-occurrence in Density Visualization

3.3. Co-Citation Network

Co-citation measures the frequency at which two documents are mentioned together (Small, 1973). Co-citation analysis, as well as counts of how many times documents, author’s works and journal titles have been cited together (McCain, 1991). Figure 10 revealed the co-citation network of authors. (Morris & Van der Veer Martens, 2008) explained that co-citation analysis categorizes references based on shared sources. By clustering highly cited publications, co-citation looked for high-density areas in the
citation network. The collection of publications illustrates the development of a specific research project that has been recognized by the academic community. It also showcases how researchers with similar interests collaborate by utilizing shared references and exploring research topics within the same field. Three clusters have been recognized as significant in this network, each compromising key contributors to the knowledge domain (Table 4). Three significant clusters have been identified in this network, which serve as the primary sources of knowledge in their respective domains.

Table 4. Co-Citation Analysis – Cluster and Themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster Name</th>
<th>Document in Each Cluster/Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Customer Satisfaction Theme</td>
<td>(Zeithaml et al., 1996), (Oliver, 1980), (Parasuraman et al., 1988), (Cronin &amp; Taylor, 1992), (Fornell et al., 1996)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Satisfaction in Hotel Industry</td>
<td>(Li et al., 2013), (Bujisic et al., 2015), (Radojevic et al., 2017), (Berezina et al., 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online Reviews</td>
<td>(Ali, 2016), (Chi &amp; Qu, 2008).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first cluster is concerned with the customer satisfaction themes. This cluster focuses on the influential researcher who pioneered the development of customer satisfaction as a significant area of research. Behavioral consequences of service quality was one of the most influential studies in this field (Zeithaml et al., 1996) and a cognitive a cognitive model of the antecedents and consequences of satisfaction decisions (Oliver, 1980), additional significant research publications that had an impact on researchers included SERVQUAL: A multiple-item scale for measuring consumer perceptions of service quality (Parasuraman et al., 1988), measuring service quality: a re-examination and extension (Cronin & Taylor, 1992). and also Fornell et al. (1996) who also proposed Customer Satisfaction Index is a widely used measure in business research to assess customer satisfaction. These publications established Customer Satisfaction as a prominent field of study within the social sciences.

The second cluster focuses on some well-known researchers in the area about determinants of customer satisfaction in the hotel industry: an application of online review analysis (Li et al., 2013) relationship between guest experience, personality characteristics, and satisfaction: moderating effect of extraversion and openness to experience (Bujisic et al., 2015), inside the rating scores: a multilevel analysis of the factors influencing customer satisfaction in the hotel industry (Radojevic et al., 2017), understanding satisfied and dissatisfied hotel customers: text mining of online hotel reviews (Berezina et al., 2016). The third cluster explore the relationships between key factors in the context of the tourism industry. Chi & Qu, (2008) explore about Examining the structural relationships of destination image, tourist satisfaction and destination loyalty: An integrated approach and Ali, (2016) Hotel website quality, perceived flow, customer satisfaction and purchase intention. these studies is the interconnection between the measured aspects. Both may involve online experiences or interactions with brand representations (whether it's destination image or hotel website), and how these experiences influence customer perceptions and behaviors, such as satisfaction and purchase intention.
3.4. Discussion

Customer satisfaction is an integral part of the field of business management. Researchers in the field of hospitality and tourism have made significant advancements in studying the crucial variables that contribute to business success. The viability and prosperity of hospitality and tourism enterprises hinge on an organization’s capacity to fulfill the standards of excellence and customer satisfaction. Since 2013, there has been a consistent increase in publications on Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry underscores the importance of this area.

According to the study’s findings, researchers from Asia published more publications, subsequently by America and Australia. Asian researchers consistently sustain their level of productivity in terms of the annual quantity of publications. An in-depth analysis of Customer Satisfaction in Hospitality and Tourism industry publication growth reveals that the majority of research articles originate from China and Malaysia in Asian region, followed by India and Indonesia. Researchers from South Korea, United States, and Australia also contribute substantially; however, the proportion of other countries share is significantly smaller in comparison. Tourism Management and Journal Travel Research were two primary sources of research on Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism industry. The authors endeavored to identify the antecedents, outcomes and suggested empirical frameworks regarding Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry. Publications by Xiang et al. (2015) and El-Adly, (2019) were identified as the most influential papers in the dataset, as they had the highest proportion of global citations.

The study investigates the conceptual framework of bibliometrics in Vosviewers using co-occurrence network analysis, identified three primary clusters. The first cluster is concerned with the customer satisfaction themes. This cluster focuses on the influential researcher who pioneered the development of customer satisfaction as a significant area of research. The second cluster focuses on some well-known researchers in the area about determinants of customer satisfaction in the hotel industry. The third cluster explore the relationships between key factors in the context of the tourism industry, especially online reviews in hotel industry. It was found that customer satisfaction research increased in 2021 – 2022. Research on customer satisfaction surged in 2021-2022, driven by the
profound impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on various sectors. Businesses, especially in hospitality and tourism, faced unprecedented challenges, prompting an increased focus on understanding customer experiences in this evolving landscape. The pandemic reshaped consumer behavior, emphasizing factors like safety, flexibility, and digital interactions.

The current study examines research publications on Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry from the SCOPUS database for the period 2013-2023. Vosviewer is utilized for performance analysis and science mapping. There has been a substantial increase in the number of research publications in the field of Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry during the study period. Most of the research conducted in the field focused on quantitative research methods. The majority of publications during the study period utilized quantitative methods in their research on Customer Satisfaction in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry (92 publications). An analysis of the abstracts indicated that the publications examined in this study demonstrate that research has been carried out to assess the level of Customer Satisfaction in various tourism environments, which include airlines, luxury hotels, mid-scale hotels, restaurants, travel agents’ services, tourist destinations, festivals, events, rural tourism and resort hotels. Many studies concentrated on developing statistical models that explained the relationships between important variables such as service quality, customer engagement, website service quality, behavioral intentions and experiential marketing. Technology and online strategy have started to get involved in Customer Satisfaction research in recent years. It is also discovered that some researchers began examining customer behavior patterns using artificial intelligence and machine learning.

It was discovered that researchers are no longer limited to a single methodology, such as testing statistical models on customer satisfaction, when examining the trend in Customer Satisfaction research in the hospitality and tourism industries. The results of recent studies in this field add to the body of knowledge. The use of machine learning, big data analysis, and artificial intelligence heralds the expansion of information technology-assisted research aimed at assessing and analyzing customer satisfaction.

4. CONCLUSION

Despite being a significant addition to Customer Satisfaction research in Hospitality and Tourism, this study’s reach was restricted to the SCOPUS database. Numerous databases, including PubMed, Dimension, Google Scholar, EBSCO, etc., were not consulted for this study. Scopus is considered as its comprehensive list of journal databases, especially in social science research (Mongeon & Paul-Hus, 2016), and serves as a trustworthy resource with an extensive selection of Customer Satisfaction research in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry that were published in academic journals throughout the study period. As a result, the study’s findings are both valid and relevant.

This investigation found numerous gaps in the literature. These are the relationship between service quality and customer satisfaction, the relationship of value co-creation, brand equity and customer satisfaction, the relationship of e-commerce service quality, trust, satisfaction, and the customer loyalty (as the outcomes), the exploration of green practices and customer satisfaction and loyalty, the impact of personalized services and
WHAT DO WE KNOW ABOUT CUSTOMER SATISFACTION IN THE HOSPITALITY AND.....

Nuril Aulia Munawaroh, Imam Mukhlis, Arief Noviarakhman Zagladi

experiences on customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism industry, explore the link between employee satisfaction, engagement, and customer satisfaction in the hospitality and tourism sector. Many studies have been conducted in the hospitality industry, but studies on the role of Customer Satisfaction in area of conference and event planning services within the broader hospitality management field may be limited.

Conducting research on quality management in the tourism and hospitality industry holds immense significance, offering benefits that extend beyond academic inquiry. By delving into themes related to service quality, researchers can pinpoint specific elements that significantly influence customer satisfaction. This knowledge becomes a valuable tool for businesses, enabling them to focus on and enhance key areas of service delivery. For future research, Beyond the business realm, this research can inform policymakers and regulators about the specific dynamics within the tourism and hospitality sector, facilitating the creation of effective policies that benefit both businesses and consumers.

In essence, research in quality management serves as a bridge between theoretical knowledge and practical applications, driving improvements in service standards, competitiveness, and overall industry resilience.

REFERENCES


WHAT DO WE KNOW ABOUT CUSTOMER SATISFACTION IN THE HOSPITALITY AND........
Nuril Aulia Munawaroh, Imam Mukhlis, Arief Noviarakhman Zagladi


Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).